

ELA.11.CR.1.12.089

Sample Item ID:	ELA.11.CR.1.12.089
Grade/Model:	11/2
Claim:	1: Students can read closely and analytically to comprehend a range of increasingly complex literary and informational texts.
Assessment Target:	12. ANALYSIS WITHIN OR ACROSS TEXTS: Analyze texts to determine how connections are made in development of complex ideas or events; or in development of topics, themes, rhetorical features
Secondary Target:	8. KEY DETAILS: Cite explicit text evidence to support inferences made or conclusions drawn about texts
Standard(s):	RI-3, RI-9 (secondary: RI-1, RI-2)
DOK:	4
Difficulty:	Hard
Item Type:	Constructed Response
Score Points:	3
Correct Response:	See rubric
Passage(s):	Susan B. Anthony speech, Second Treatise of Government by John Locke
Stimuli/Text Complexity:	<p>Susan B. Anthony Speech: The quantitative and qualitative measures both suggest that the appropriate placement for this passage is at grade 11 or 12. Based on these sets of measures, this passage is recommended for assessment at grade 11. Please see the text complexity worksheet attached.</p> <p>John Locke piece: Though brief, the passage is dense and will be challenging. The quantitative analysis places the passage in the 9.03-10 range; the qualitative analysis suggests something a bit higher. Based on these sets of measures, this passage is recommended for assessment at grade 11. Please see the text complexity worksheet attached.</p>
Acknowledgement(s):	Anthony speech - http://gos.sbc.edu/a/anthony.html Locke - http://www.gutenberg.org/files/7370/7370-h/7370-h.htm#CHAPTER_IV
Notes:	
How this task contributes to the sufficient evidence for this claim:	To answer this item, students must analyze common ideas found in two texts and cite evidence from each text to support their analysis.
Target-Specific Attributes (e.g., accessibility issues):	This task requires students to enter text using a keyboard.

Stimulus Text:

Read the following passages and then answer the question.

Passage 1

The following excerpt comes from a speech written in 1872 by women’s rights pioneer Susan B. Anthony. Anthony was arrested after attempting to vote in the 1872 presidential election. After her conviction Anthony wrote this speech to make a constitutional argument for giving women the right to vote.

Our democratic-republican government is based on the idea of the natural right of every individual member thereof to a voice and a vote in making and executing the laws. We assert the province of government to be to secure the people in the enjoyment of their inalienable right. We throw to the winds the old dogma that government can give rights. No one denies that before governments were organized each individual possessed the right to protect his own life, liberty and property. When 100 to 1,000,000 people enter into a free government, they do not barter away their natural rights; they simply pledge themselves to protect each other in the enjoyment of them through prescribed judicial and legislative tribunals. They agree to abandon the methods of brute force in the adjustment of their differences and adopt those of civilization . . .The Declaration of Independence, the United States Constitution, the constitutions of the several States and the organic laws of the Territories, all alike propose to protect the people in the exercise of their God-given rights. Not one of them pretends to bestow rights.

All men are created equal, and endowed by their Creator with certain inalienable rights. Among these are life, liberty and the pursuit of happiness. To secure these, governments are instituted among men, deriving their just powers from the

consent of the governed.

Passage 2

The following excerpt comes from the Second Treatise of Government by John Locke, published in 1690.

Sect. 22. The natural liberty of man is to be free from any superior power on earth, and not to be under the will or legislative authority of man, but to have only the law of nature for his rule. The liberty of man, in society, is to be under no other legislative power, but that established, by consent, in the commonwealth; nor under the dominion of any will, or restraint of any law, but what that legislative shall enact, according to the trust put in it. Freedom then is not what Sir Robert Filmer tells us, *Observations, A. 55. a liberty for every one to do what he lists, to live as he pleases, and not to be tied by any laws*: but freedom of men under government is, to have a standing rule to live by, common to every one of that society, and made by the legislative power erected in it; a liberty to follow my own will in all things, where the rule prescribes not; and not to be subject to the inconstant, uncertain, unknown, arbitrary will of another man: as freedom of nature is, to be under no other restraint but the law of nature.

Item Prompt:

Identify the main idea of each passage and explain how Locke's treatise supports Anthony's argument.

Scoring Rubric	
3 Proficient	A response: Gives sufficient evidence of the ability to identify the idea common to the two texts and explain how the ideas in Locke's treatise support the ideas in Anthony's argument.
2	A response: Gives some evidence of the ability to identify the idea common to the two texts and explain how the ideas in Locke's treatise support the ideas in Anthony's argument.
1	A response: Gives limited evidence of the ability to identify the idea common to the two

	texts and explain how the ideas in Locke’s treatise support the ideas in Anthony’s argument.
0	A response gets no credit if it provides no evidence of the ability to identify the idea common to the two texts and explain how the ideas in Locke’s treatise support the ideas in Anthony’s argument, includes no relevant information from the text, or is vague.

Scoring Notes:

Responses may include but are not limited to: Students should indicate that both authors believe that all people have natural rights and therefore government can only work if people are allowed to vote for the lawmakers, otherwise government violates the natural rights of citizens. This reasoning supports Anthony’s argument that not allowing women to vote violates their natural rights.

Score Point 3 Sample: Anthony argues that government is based on the natural right of every person to vote on laws. People join governments not to give away rights but to agree that the government will protect those rights. Locke also states that people have natural rights and participation in society necessitates agreement to common laws. Locke states that people in society can only be free under laws made with their consent, i.e. passed by an elected legislature. Locke’s treatise supports Anthony’s argument because Locke’s idea that people should be under no legislative power but that established by consent supports Anthony’s point that women’s natural rights are taken away when they are forced to obey laws they did not consent to, in that they could not vote for the legislatures that make the laws.

Score Point 2 Sample: Both Anthony and Locke believe that everyone has a natural right to be free and that government can not take away that right. Locke states that people can only be free if they are able to vote for their government, the people that make the laws. Anthony argues that women are not free because they are not allowed to vote. Locke and Anthony agree that governments where citizens are not allowed to vote are governments where people are not free and this violates the laws of nature.

Score Point 1 Sample: Anthony should have used the treatise by Locke to argue for the right of women to vote. Locke proves that women were not free because they couldn’t vote and this means they were under the law of nature, not the “legislative authority of man.”

Score Point 0 Sample: Susan B Anthony’s speech is about giving women the right to vote. Locke’s treatise is about the right of men to vote.

Worksheet: Text Complexity Analysis		
Title	Author	Text Description
Susan B. Anthony Speech	Susan B. Anthony	Classic speech by Anthony after being arrested for voting



Recommended Placement for Assessment: Grade 11

The quantitative and qualitative measures both suggest that the appropriate placement for this passage is at grade 11 or 12. **Based on these sets of measures, this passage is recommended for assessment at grade 11.**

Qualitative Measures	Quantitative Measures
<p>Meaning/Purpose: <u>Exceedingly complex:</u> A completely theoretical and complex piece. The purpose evolves throughout the piece and is really not made entirely clear until the end.</p> <p>Text Structure: <u>Exceedingly complex:</u> Connections between ideas are subtle and complex.</p> <p>Language Features: <u>Exceedingly complex:</u> Language is dense and frequently abstract. The vocabulary is often archaic and academic. Sentence structure is varied and complex.</p> <p>Knowledge Demands: <u>Very complex:</u></p>	<p>Common Core State Standards Appendix A Complexity Band Level (if applicable):</p> <p>Lexile or Other Quantitative Measure of the Text:</p> <p>Lexile: 1350L; grades 11-CCR Flesch-Kincaid: 12.4 Word Count:</p> <p style="background-color: #0070C0; color: white; padding: 2px;">Considerations for Passage Selection</p> <p>Passage selection should be based on the ELA Content Specifications targets and the cognitive demands of the assessment tasks.</p> <p>Potential Challenges a Text May Pose:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Accessibility • Sentence and text structures • Archaic language, slang, idioms, or other language challenges • Background knowledge • Bias and sensitivity issues • Word count

Adapted from the 2012 ELA SCASS work

Worksheet: Text Complexity Analysis		
Title	Author	Text Description
Second Treatise of Government	John Locke	Essay on slavery/freedom



Recommended Placement for Assessment: Grade 11

Though brief, the passage is dense and will be challenging. The quantitative analysis places the passage in the 9.03-10 range; the qualitative analysis suggests something a bit higher. **Based on these sets of measures, this passage is recommended for assessment at grade 11.**

Qualitative Measures	Quantitative Measures
<p>Meaning/Purpose: <u>Very complex:</u> The purpose is clear but all theoretical. It requires some inferring.</p> <p>Text Structure: <u>Very complex:</u> The piece is brief; the connections between ideas are subtle.</p> <p>Language Features: <u>Exceedingly complex:</u> The language demands are high. The vocabulary will generally be unfamiliar; the sentences are complex and often contain multiple concepts.</p> <p>Knowledge Demands: <u>Very complex:</u> Some background knowledge about Locke would be helpful.</p>	<p>Common Core State Standards Appendix A Complexity Band Level (if applicable):</p> <p>Lexile or Other Quantitative Measure of the Text: Lexile: 1240L; grades 9-10 and 11-CCR Flesch-Kincaid: 9/3 Word Count: 198</p> <p style="background-color: #0056b3; color: white; padding: 2px;">Considerations for Passage Selection</p> <p>Passage selection should be based on the ELA Content Specifications targets and the cognitive demands of the assessment tasks.</p> <p>Potential Challenges a Text May Pose:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Accessibility • Sentence and text structures • Archaic language, slang, idioms, or other language challenges • Background knowledge • Bias and sensitivity issues • Word count

Adapted from the 2012 ELA SCASS work